INTERNALIZATION OF MULTICULTURAL VALUES IN ARABIC LEARNING

Ubadah Ubadah¹

¹Fakultas Tarbiyah dan Ilmu Keguruan, IAIN Palu, Palu, ubadah@iainpalu.ac.id

Abstract: Internalization of multicultural values has become the concern of many researchers today, but how the process of internalization in learning, especially language learning, is still a little done. For this reason, this study focuses on the approach of internalizing multicultural values in learning Arabic at one of the State Madrasah Aliyah schools in the city of Palu. This research uses a qualitative case study approach. The data were collected by means of observation, in-depth interviews, and from written documents. The results showed that multicultural values were internalized through the curriculum, syllabus, and lesson plans (RPP). The process of integrating multicultural values which includes spiritual values and social attitudes is carried out through semi-contributive, semi-additive, and indirect teaching processes. The integrated values include spiritual attitudes and social attitudes that encourage the growth of multiculturalism values.

Keywords: Internalisation, approach, sprituality, and multicultualism

Abstrak: Internalisasi nialai-nilai multikultural telah menjadi perhatian banyak peneliti saat ini, tetapi bagaimana proses internalisasi dalam pembelajaran terutama pembejalaran bahasa masih sedikit dilakukan. Untuk itu penelitian ini berfokus pada pendekatan internalisasi nilai-nilai multikultural pembelajaran bahasa Arab di salah satu sekolah Madrasah Aliyah Negeri yang ada di kota Palu. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan kualitatif studi kasus. Pengumpulan data dilakukan dengan teknik observasi, wawancara mendalam, dan dari bahanbahan dokumen tertulis. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa nilainilai multikultural di internalisasikan melalui kurikulum, silabus, dan rencana pembelajaran (RPP). Proses pengintegrasian nilai - nilai multikultural yang mencakup nilai-nilai spiritual dan sikap sosial dilakukan melalui proses semi kontributif, semi aditif, dan indirect teaching. Nilai-nilai yang diintegrasikan mencakup sikap spiritual dan sikap sosial mendorong tumbuhnya yang multikulturalisme.

Kata Kunci: internalisasi, pendekatan, spiritual, dan multikultural

Introduction

Education has a significant role in the process of improving the quality of human resources and is a vehicle in the process of internalizing values, culture, and character into individuals and community groups so as to make them civilized. Therefore, education is not a means of transferring *ansich* knowledge, but more broadly as a means of enculturation or culture and distribution of values.¹

In Law No. 20 of 2003 the functions and objectives of national education are formulated which aim to develop the potential of students to become human beings who believe and fear God Almighty, have noble character, are healthy, knowledgeable, capable, creative, independent, and become citizens who are democratic and responsible.² According to Jason Lase, in terms of the constellation of laws and regulations, especially Law no. 20 concerning the National Education System, has reflected and contained the principles and perspectives of multicultural education.³

Thomas Lickona has the view that educators have the power to instill values and character in children in at least three ways, namely, first, the teacher (educator) can be an effective lover, second, the teacher (educator) can become an ethical model by showing a high sense of responsibility both inside and outside the classroom, third, teachers (educators) can become ethical mentors by providing moral instruction and guidance through explanations and discussions in class, telling stories and providing personal motivation, and providing corrective feedback when there are students who hurt their friends or

¹ Kurniati, Kurniati, Nurdin, Nurdin, & Nurasmawati, Nurasmawati. (2020). Improving Students' Cognitive and Affective Domains Students through Fostering Teacher Development International Journal of Contemporary Islamic Education, 2(2), 56-70.

² See Undang-undang Republik Indonesia No 20 Tahun 2003 Tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional. (Jakarta: Depdiknas RI, 2010), 5.

³Kasinyo Harto, *Pengembangan Pendidikan Agama Islam Berbasis Multikutural*, Jurnal At-Tahrir Volume 14 No. 2 Mei 2014, 411 431

themselves.⁴ Therefore, an educator not only provides knowledge to his students, but he must also be able to transform values to students.⁵

Educators are the most important component in the process of spreading values, including the cultivation of multicultural values in their students. Educators are expected to be able to spread and apply insight into multicultural values in the learning process in the classroom and in the midst of society in a broader context. The multicultural education paradigm implies that individuals can learn from other individuals in an atmosphere of mutual respect, mutual tolerance, and mutual understanding. Included in internalizing the values of multicultural education in students, of course, a relevant approach and strategy is needed for the realization of multiculturalist students who can always accept differences and are aware of diversity and are not exclusive. In this case, the authors conducted research on approaches to internalizing the values of multicultural education, especially in learning Arabic at one of the State Madrasah Aliyah in Palu City.

In order for this paper to focus more on the issues discussed, the author will focus on answering the following problems, namely: What multicultural values are internalized and what approaches are used in internalizing the values of multicultural education in learning Arabic in MAN 1 Palu City?

The objectives of this research is to find out what multicultural values are internalized in learning and what approaches are used in internalizing the values of multicultural education in learning Arabic in MAN 1, Palu City. By knowing the multicultural values that are implemented and the approaches used, it will help schools to instill multicultural values in their schools in order to increase tolerance among students and educators.

⁴Lihat Thomas Lickona, Educating for Chracter: How Our School Can Teach Respect and Responsibility, (New York: Bantam Books 2000), Bab 5. 99-100

⁵Khoiran Rosyadi, *Pendidikan Profetik*, (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2004), 172

⁶ Evita, Evita, Syahid, Ahmad, & Nurdin, Nurdin. (2019). Understanding Students' Learning Outcomes Differences Through the Application of the Market Place Activity Type of Cooperative Learning Model and the Application of Conventional Learning Models *International Journal of Contemporary Islamic Education*, 1(1), 67-85.

Theoritical Review

Concept of Multicultural Education

Before discussing more about multicultural education, first is the explanation of education. In the Big Indonesian Dictionary, education is defined as the process of changing the attitudes and behavior of a person or group of people in an effort to mature humans through teaching and training efforts; education also means the process, methods, and actions to educate.

The definition of education includes all aspects of human life and includes all environments and living situations that affect individual growth.⁷ Thus, the existence of a better community life can be marked by the legacy of values and culture that is already owned by the community and nation.

As for the meaning of multicultural education, there are many opinions and debates from experts.⁸ According to James A. Banks, multicultural education "... is an inclusive concept used to describe a wide variety of school practices, programs and materials designed to help children from diverse groups to experience educational equality ..." ⁹

This definition emphasizes an educational strategy that helps each student to develop his / her potential and capacity to the fullest. Therefore, every educator must pay attention to their students fairly without distinguishing the racial, ethnic, religious, or cultural backgrounds of students. Because each of them has potential and uniqueness that can be honed and developed.

In the Indonesian context, discourses on multicultural education have begun to appear and have emerged in recent times. Multicultural education and

⁷Ubadah, Metode Pembelajaan Bahasa Arab Efektif Untuk Meningaktkan Kemampuan Bercakap Bahasa Arab, Jurnal Istiqra' (Jurnal Penelitian Ilmiah LP2M IAIN Palu) Volume 4 No 1 Juni 2016

⁸Richaard Race, Multiculturalism and Education., 5

⁹James A. Banks, Race, Culture, and Education: The Selected Works of James A. Banks. (London: Routledge, 2006), 11, Lihat juga Dede Rosyada, Pendidikan Multikultural di Indonesia, Sebuah Pandangan Konseptual, Jurnal Sosio Didaktika, Volume 1 No. 1 Mei 2014, hlm. 3

pluralism by humanist Frans Magnis Suseno¹⁰ as an education that will open a broader vision and be able to cross the boundaries of existing ethnic groups or religious traditions (in Indonesia), so that people are able to see humanity as a family that has differences and similarities in ideals.

Multicultural education is an educational strategy that is integrated into all types of subjects that accommodate all cultural differences of learners, such as differences in ethnicity, religion, gender, language, social class, age, and abilities or skills. In addition, multicultural education is also needed to train and build the character of students so that they are able to be democratic, humanist, and pluralist in their environment and in society.¹¹

Multicultural education should facilitate the teaching and learning process and change an essential, prejudiced and discriminatory monocultural perspective into a multicultural perspective that respects diversity and difference, is tolerant and is not closed or inclusive. A paradigm shift like this requires a transformation that not only demands a mere cognitive dimension, but also demands changes in the affective and psychomotor dimensions. Therefore, multicultural education is an object that must be pursued as an approach that is considered relevant to the heterogeneous conditions of Indonesian society.

Multicultural education as value education, must be approached holistically and simultaneously. As a strategy, multicultural education is not a part of the whole educational process, but it is the spirit that fills all components of school education to go hand in hand towards the formation of multicultural personalities. This spirit must be explicit in educational

¹⁰Ngainum Naim dan Ahmad Sauqi, Pendidikan Multikultural, 50

¹¹M.Ainul Yaqin, Pendidikan Multikultural Cross-Cultural Understanding untuk Demokrasi dan keadilan, (Yogyakarta: Pilar Media 2005), 25

¹²Choirul Mahfud, *Pendidikan Multikultural*, (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar 2016), 17. Lihat Juga Supriadi, *Pendidikan Islam Multikultural*, *Tantangan dan relevansinya di Indonesia*. Ittihad (Jurnal Kopetais wilayah XI Kalimantan) Volume 13 No, 23 April 2016

dimensions that are not limited to goals, curriculum, learning, management, and evaluation.¹³

In principle, multicultural education is education that respects differences. According to Syafiq A. Mughni, ¹⁴ multicultural education will always create structures and processes where each culture can express itself. In designing multicultural education in practical terms it is not easy. But at least, we try to carry out ijtihad to design according to the principles of multiculturalism. At least, there are two things that can be pursued in the context of realizing multicultural education that is able to provide space for freedom for all cultures to express themselves, namely dialogue and tolerance. Dialogue requires equality and equality between the parties involved. Meanwhile, tolerance is the attitude of accepting that other people are different from us. Dialogue and tolerance are an inseparable unity. If dialogue is form, then tolerance is content. Tolerance is needed not only at an ansich conceptual level, but also at an operational technical level.

In general, multicultural education is an effort that tries to help unite the nation in a democratic manner, by emphasizing the plurality perspective of society in different nations, ethnicities and different cultural groups. In this case schools are conditioned to reflect the practice of democratic values. The curriculum shows a variety of different cultural groups in society, language and dialect.¹⁵

According to Hilda Hernandez,¹⁶ multicultural education is a perspective that recognizes the political, social and economic realities experienced by each individual in complex and culturally diverse human encounters and reflects the importance of culture, race, sexuality and gender, ethnicity, religion, social

 $^{^{\}rm 13}$ Raihani, Pendidikan Islam dalam Masyarakat Multikultural. (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar 2016), 201

¹⁴Lihat Syafiq A. Mughni, Pendidikan Berbasis Multikulturalisme, Kata Pengantar dalam Choirul Mahfud, *Pendidikan Multikultural...* xiii

¹⁵Suparlan Alhakim dan Sri Untari, *Pendidikan Multikultural, Strategi Inovatif Pembelajaran dalam Pluralitas Masyarakat Indonesia.* (Malang: Madani Media, 2018), 1

¹⁶Hilda Hernandez, Multicultural Education: A Teacher's Guide to Linking Context, Process, and Content (New Jersey & Ohio: Pentice Hall 2000), 6

status, economic, and exclusions in the educational process. In other words, that the educational space as a medium for knowledge transformation (transfer of knowledge) should be able to provide multicultural values by respecting and appreciating different realities (plural), both different backgrounds and the socio-cultural bases that complement them.

Multicultural Education Goals

The objectives of multicultural education, according to Ainul Yaqin,¹⁷ generally have two objectives, first, namely to build a multicultural education discourse among educators, namely teachers and lecturers, education experts, policy makers in the world of education, as well as students especially majoring in education. If they have a good multicultural education perspective, then later they will not only be able to build the skills and expertise of students on the subjects they teach, but they are also able to become the motor of multicultural education and instill the values of humanism, pluralism, and values. democracy towards students in educational institutions occupied by teaching. Second, multicultural education aims so that students are not only able to understand and master the subject matter they are learning, but they are expected to have a strong character to always be democratic, pluralist, and humanist.

According to James A. Banks, there are 4 goals for multicultural education, namely:

- a) To help individuals gain greater self understanding by viewing themselves from the perspectives of other culture "(helping individuals to understand themselves deeply by reflecting on the perspective of other cultures.
- b) To provide student with cultural ethnical alternatives (equipping students with knowledge of other ethnicities and cultures)

¹⁷M.Ainul Yaqin, 26 , Lihat juga Masnun Tahir, Menjadi Muslim di Negara Multikultural: Dinamika, Tantangan, dan Strategi dalam Perspektif Fiqhi Multikultural, Jurnal Al-'Adalah (Universitas Raden Intan Lampung) Volume 14 No Tahun 2017

c) To reduce the pain and discrimination that members of some ethnic groups experience because of their unique racial, physical, and cultural characteristics "(reduce pain and discrimination due to ethnic groups, races, skin colors, and cultural characteristics).

d) to help students to master essential reading, writing, and math skills "(helping students to master the basic skills of reading, writing and arithmetic).¹⁸

The formulation of multicultural education goals was also put forward by F.E. Kendall with five main objectives, namely: first, to teach students to always respect the values and culture of others in addition to their own values and culture; second, helping all students to become human beings who are useful in a society of diverse races and cultures; third, develop a positive self-concept in students who are influenced by the race of children of color; fourth, helping all students to experience or live their own lives in similarities and differences as human beings in praiseworthy ways; and fifth, encourage and provide experiences for learners working with people of different cultures as part of society as a whole.¹⁹

By referring to the formulation of multicultural education goals above, it is hoped that multicultural education can help students become more aware of the teachings of their own religion and culture and aware of the cultural realities and teachings of other religions; help students develop understanding and appreciation of other people's cultures and religions; encourage students to be able to participate in social activities in which various adherents of different religions and cultures are involved; help students develop all their own potential including their religious potential so that they can control their own lives, and in this way they are more empowered.²⁰

¹⁸James A. Banks, An Introduction to Multicultural Education, (New York: Pearson, 2017) 44

¹⁹Frances Kendall, Diversity in The Classroom, a Multicultural Approhach to Education of Young Children, (New York: Teacher College Press, 1990) 1-7

²⁰Kasinyo Harto, Jurnal... 420

Thus, multicultural education aims to empower students to develop respect for people of different cultures (faith or beliefs), providing opportunities to work together with people or groups of different ethnic or racial groups directly. In addition, multicultural education will help students recognize the existence of diverse cultural views, help students develop pride in their cultural heritage and make them realize that value conflicts are often the cause of conflict between groups in society. Strictly speaking, multicultural education is held with the aim of developing the ability of students to view life from various cultural perspectives that are different from the culture they have, as well as being positive about cultural, racial, and ethnic differences.²¹

The application of multicultural education in schools by integrating or internalizing learning has not been fully implemented properly. Therefore, multicultural education for students is very urgent to be pushed as a foundation for generations in order to form a more inclusive, tolerant, and democratic society in the nation of Indonesia. The most significant and prominent strength in the context of multicultural education in students is how their ability to accept differences as something natural and proper (sunnatullah) and emphasizes the importance of religious education in order to fight for and realize universal values in students.

Values in Multicultural Education

Value education is education that is oriented towards the formation of a whole human being, capable of developing his potential, both spiritual and physical, and fostering a harmonious relationship with God, man and the universe. Value education is a vehicle for instilling moral values and religious teachings. Its presence is expected to be able to bring changes and meaningful

²¹Suparlan Alhakim dan Sri Untari, Pendidikan Multikultural, Strategi, 4

new contributions to human moral improvement, both at the theoretical and practical intellectual level.²²

In the context of multicultural learning, the inculcation of multicultural values in education is very important and is the right idea in order to reduce and inhibit the emergence of social problems caused by diversity. The idea of multicultural education has become a global commitment since October 1994 when UNESCO recommended it with several messages, including:

- a) Education should develop the ability to recognize and accept the values that exist in personal, gender, community and cultural diversity and develop the ability to communicate, share and cooperate with others.
- b) Education should strengthen identity and encourage convergence of ideas and solutions that strengthen peace, brotherhood and solidarity between individuals and society.
- c) Education should increase the ability to resolve conflicts peacefully without violence. Therefore, education should also enhance the development of peace in the minds of students so that they can build a stronger quality of tolerance, patience, a willingness to share, and nurture one another.²³

Based on the UNESCO recommendation, there are four main ideas that become the idea, namely, tolerance, democracy, equality and justice. In the context of multicultural education, these four things are the values discussed by multicultural education in addition to other values such as human rights, accepting and respecting diversity, mutual understanding, caring, and non-discrimination. Meanwhile, the basic value of the concept of multicultural education, according to Naim and Syauqi,²⁴ is tolerance, namely respecting all differences as a reality that must be positioned properly, not forced into one particular conception.

²²Qiqi Yuliati Zakiyah dan H.A. Rusdiana, 131

²³Salmiwati, *Urgensi Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam Pengembangan Nilai-nilai Multikutural.* Jurnal At-Ta'lim, Jilid 1 Namor 4 Februari 2013. Hlm. 338

²⁴Ngainum Naim dan Ahmad Sauqi, *Pendidikan Multikultural*, 52

Thus, the values of multiculturalism ultimately imply respect for other human beings who also have a culture, or in other words, multiculturalism produces a humanistic character. Multicultural based education is the initial learning that respects the differences that occur around us.²⁵

The four basic values of multicultural education as can be drawn from the UNESCO recommendations above are as follows:

Tolerance

Tolerance in English and tasamuh in Arabic, is one of the basic values of multicultural education that needs to be understood by students. In addition, tolerance is also included in the value of cultural education and national character.

Tolerance is attitudes and actions that respect differences in religion, ethnicity, opinion, attitudes and actions of others who are different from oneself. Tolerance in social life between religious communities is not tolerance in religious matters, but rather a manifestation of the religious attitude of adherents of a religion in social life between people who are not of the same religion. As religious people, it is hoped that they can build a tradition of religious discourse that respects the existence of other religions, and can present a religious discourse that is tolerant and transformative. Tolerance can also mean tolerant attitude, can respect the feelings of others. Tolerance is allowing and accepting differences, either temporarily or for a long time. But the setting of the same religious discourse that is tolerant and transformative.

Democracy

Democracy is usually equated with freedom which in Arabic terms means al-hurriyyah. According to the Big Indonesian Dictionary (KBBI), democracy is

²⁵Sutiyono, Values of Multiculturalism in The Process of Teaching and Learning the Dance Arts, Journal of Studies in Social Sciences, ISSN 2201-4624, Volume 11 Number 1, 2015. Hlm. 101

²⁶Qiqi Yuliati Zakiyah dan H.A. Rusdiana, *Pendidikan Nilai*, 112

²⁷Nurkhalis Madjid, *Pluralitas Agama, Kerukunan dalam Keragaman.* (Jakarta: Kompas Media Nusantara, 2001), 39

²⁸Yaya Suryana dan H.A. Rusdiana, *Pendidikan Multikultural*, 158

an idea or way of life that prioritizes equal rights and obligations as well as equal treatment for all citizens.²⁹

John Dewey, as quoted by Tilaar, linked the democratic process and the educational process. Democracy is not only a matter of procedural or form of government, but also a "way of life". And as a way of life or as a weltanschauung of a community, this cannot be achieved without an educational process. The educational process itself must be a democratic process.³⁰

Justice

Justice or al-'adalah is a term that comes from the Arabic language al-'adl which means balance, fair, proper, just. In the Big Indonesian Dictionary, ³¹ justice is defined as being impartial, not taking sides, holding on to the truth. Justice is the awareness to treat others impartially, impartially, and does not discriminate against others due to differences in skin color, class, ethnicity, religion, economy, gender, and so on. ³²

Equality

The term equality (al-musãwah) comes from the word equivalent, which in the Big Indonesian Dictionary means paralell, equal, balanced, comparable.³³ So, equality can be interpreted as equality which means the existence of the same level or the same position.

The basic values of multicultural education are in principle also part of the characteristics of multicultural education, such as democracy, equality and justice; humanity, togetherness and peace; and recognizing, accepting and valuing diversity. To be more complete, it is also stated the values of

²⁹Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa, *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia Edisi Kelima*, (Digital Version) KBBI V. 0.2.0 Beta (20)

³⁰H.A.R. Tilaar, Multikulturalisme, Tantangan-tantangan Global Masa Depan dalam Transformasi Pendidikan Nasional, (Jakarta: Grasindo, 2004) 179

³¹Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa, *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia Edisi Kelima*, (Digital Version) KBBI V. 0.2.0 Beta (20)

³²Imam Tolkhah dkk, *Panduan Integrasi Nilai*, 65

³³Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa, *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia Edisi Kelima*, (Digital Version) KBBI V. 0.2.0 Beta (20)

muticultural education that have been formulated by an association engaged in the field of education.

According to the Indonesian Islamic Education Teachers Association (AGPAII), the relevant multicultural education values to be developed in Indonesia are as follows:

- 1. The value of equality, namely by having the view that humans are in the same situation; humans are destined to be equal and comparable and have their respective roles to complement each other; and treat others as equal.
- 2. The value of compassion, namely feelings of love and affection for fellow creatures of God and carrying out actions or activities for others on the basis of love for the common good.
- 3. The value of empathy, namely one's awareness of the feelings, needs and interests of others.
- 4. The value of justice is the awareness to treat others impartially, not taking sides, and does not differentiate between others due to differences in skin color, class, ethnicity, religion, economy, gender, and so on.
- 5. The value of nationalism, is the awareness of membership in a nation that potentially or actually jointly achieve, maintain, and devote the nation's identity, integrity, prosperity and strength, the national spirit to cooperate with other nations in the framework of showing its nation.
- 6. The value of cooperation, awareness and willingness to cooperate with others regardless of differences in race or color, class, ethnicity, religion, and gender economy to achieve the common good.
- 7. Value of tolerance, awareness to tolerate (respect, permit, allow) different or contradictory views, opinions, beliefs, habits, behavior.
- 8. Good prejudice value, good opinion (assumption) about something before knowing (witnessing, investigating) yourself.
- 9. The value of solidarity, the nature (feeling) of solidarity; nature or taste (the same fate). Solidarity means having or showing a feeling of unity (the same fate, humiliation, shame, and so on).

10. The value of mutual trust, the awareness to uphold the commitments that have been made together and believe that others can trust.

- 11.Self-confidence, the awareness to believe in one's ability to contribute something or participate in the environment.
- 12. The value of responsibility, awareness to want to do something that is their obligation, awareness in exercising their rights and obligations in a balanced manner so as not to interfere with the public interest.
- 13. Value of honesty, uprightness; not lying (saying what it is; not cheating or not being mocked, and following the prevailing treatment).
- 14. The value of sincerity, being sincere and pure in heart (really comes out of a pure heart); honest; not pretending; in doing an action for someone else.
- 15. The value of trust, willingness and awareness to be trusted by others if given a task, can be trusted.
- 16.The value of deliberation, awareness and willingness to carry out joint discussions with the intention of reaching a decision or solving a problem.³⁴

These are the values of multicultural education that have been formulated by several experts as a guide and reference material in implementing and internalizing the values of multicultural education in the school community and society in a general sense. If these values can be implemented properly, it will undoubtedly create a harmonious society, mutual respect, which in the end will create a civil society or civil society.

Approach to the Application of Multicultural Education

The meaning of an approach or approach in multicultural education is that in interpreting and implementing mutlicultural education there are several schools, schools, or understandings, whose implementation becomes what is understood.³⁵

³⁴Imam Tolkhah dkk, *Panduan Integrasi Nilai*, 64-66

³⁵Tatang M. Amirin, Pendekatan dan langkah Pendidikan Multikultural, dalam https://tatangmanguni.wordpres.com/2009/6/11/pendekatan - pendekatan - dan -langkah-langkah-pendidikan-multikultural/ diunduh pada tanggal 24 Maret 2019

According to Sulalah, the learning approach can be interpreted as a point of departure or a person's point of view towards the learning process which refers to the view of the occurrence of a process which is still very general, in which it accommodates, inspires, strengthens, and underpins learning methods with certain theoretical coverage. From the learning approach that has been determined, then it is lowered into learning strategies.³⁶

In James A. Banks' writing "Approaches to Multicultural Curriculum Reform" Banks suggests four approaches that integrate multicultural education material into the curriculum and internalize it in learning in schools.

- a. Contribution approach, an approach at this level that is most often used when schools are first trying to integrate multicultural content into the main curriculum. This contribution approach is characterized by the insertion or insertion of the names of heroes from ethnic groups / ethnicities and cultural objects into the relevant lessons (this is what has been done in Indonesia so far). The substance of multicultural education at this stage is to instill in students that humans who live around it and in other places and in this world are very diverse. Such as various types of food, clothing, and others from various regions.
- b. Additive approach, at this stage adding materials, concepts or themes, and perspectives to the curriculum without changing the basic structure, objectives, and basic characteristics. This additive approach is often complemented by books, modules, or subject areas of the curriculum without changing it substantially. The additive approach is actually the initial phase in implementing multicultural education, because it has not yet touched the main curriculum.
- c. Transformation approach, the transformation approach is fundamentally different from the contribution and additive approaches. The transformation

³⁶Sulalah, Pendidikan Multikultural, Didaktika Niali-nilai Universalitas Kebangsaan, (Malang: UIN Maliki Press, 2011), 125

³⁷James A. Banks, Multicultural education, Perspectives...237-248

approach changes the basic assumptions of the curriculum and fosters students' basic competencies in seeing concepts, issues, themes, and problems from several ethnic perspectives and perspectives. The application of this approach implies the creation of a curriculum by accommodating groups with different cultural backgrounds, both mainstream and splinter. This approach aims to open the perspectives of culturally different groups (outsiders) to comment and explain the material discussed.

d. Social action approach, this approach includes all elements of the transformation approach, but adds a component that requires students to make actions related to concepts, issues, or problems learned in the unit. The main purpose of this learning and approach is to educate students to be able to do social criticism and teach decision-making skills to help them gain political education.

Apart from the approaching methods above, there are also other approaches that are also interesting to know, namely the approach offered by Carl A. Grant and Christine E. Sleeter, quoted by Ilghis M. Sinagatullin³⁸ in his book entitled "Constructing Multicultural Eduction in a Diverse Society" which suggests five kinds of approaches in multicultural education, namely: (1) teaching the exeptional and culturally different, (2) human relations, (3) single-group studies, (4) multicultural education, (5) education that is multicultural and social recontructionist.

Another approach offered by other experts such as Geneva Gay in Sulalah³⁹ is almost in line with the approach offered by James Banks who also offers four approaches, namely,

³⁸Ilghiz M. Sinagatullin, *Constructing Multicultural Eduction in a Diverse Society*, (Maryland: Scarecrow Press.Inc, 2003) 94-95

³⁹Sulalah, Pendidikan Multikultural... 128, lihat juga Geneva Gay, Bridging Multicultural Theory and Praktis, (tp, 1999) 560-563,lihat juga Nurcahyono, Hadi. Pendidikan Multikultural di Indonesia: Analisis Sinkronis dan Duakronis. Jurnal Habitus: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosiologi, dan Antropologi, Volume 2 No. 1 Maret 2018

- a) A deconstructive approach, an approach that is often considered as criticism, questioning, and reconstruction of knowledge by educational experts. The deconstructive stage directs teaching and learning toward nurturing a person to be a person who constantly questions existing claims to truth, and to determine that the perspectives of different ethnic and cultural groups are represented.
- b) The inclusion approach, which is an approach that emphasizes factual teaching about the history, heritage, and contribution of ethnic and cultural groups who are marginalized and underrepresented in the educational curriculum, while teaching focuses on the concept of heroism, introducing someone to the diversity of existing cultures that also provide contributes to society as a whole, and defines cultural heroism according to the standards of ethnic groups, religions, and social literature on the standards of different ethnic groups, religions and social strata.
- c) The infusion approach, which is an approach that systematically integrates content, context, examples, and perspectives from various groups to illustrate concepts, principles, theories, and search methods from various perspectives into the entire curriculum so as to expand the area content, discipline, and programs. This approach requires substantial changes in the educational process and curriculum structure to ensure cultural pluralism is integral to the learning experiences of individuals, both majority and minority.
- d) The transformative approach, which is an approach that emphasizes social and political action to solve problems logically, goes beyond the traditional class context. Therefore, it is necessary to replace old models, or at least revise and create new ones. To reveal the accuracy of a pattern, it is necessary to have clarity in advance about certain patterns in the context of the required strategy.

In implementing the multicultural educational approaches above, its success depends on the role and ability of educators in understanding the

problems of multiculturalism. Thus, the role of educators in multicultural education in schools is very important. In this context, educators must master basic teaching skills, such as skills to open and close lessons, skills to provide variety, reinforcement skills, question skills, class management, and so on. The implementation of multicultural education in (class) learning can actually be done to integrate or internalize multicultural material into the curriculum and can be integrated into actual teaching situations in all subjects. Indeed, in this case it is easier to implement in lessons related to socio-culture.

Thus, the approaches taken in multicultural learning are helping students to develop the ability to recognize, accept, appreciate, and celebrate cultural diversity with all the differences that accompany it and the treatment of the same learning process, so that it is hoped that children can have good character as adults. later. Multicultural education must be able to facilitate a teaching and learning process that changes an essential, prejudiced and discriminatory monocultural perspective to a multiculturalist perspective that respects diversity and difference, is tolerant, and always has an open attitude.

Research Methodolody

This study uses a qualitative research method with a case study approach⁴⁰⁷⁴¹. The location of this research is in MAN 1 Palu City. Data were collected using direct observation techniques, in-depth interviews with Arabic language teachers, principals, deputy principals, students and by reviewing various documents related to the application of multicultural education. According to Morse,⁴² the focus of qualitative research is on the shared meaning

⁴⁰ Nurdin, Nurdin. (2018). Institutional Arrangements in E-Government Implementation and Use: A Case Study From Indonesian Local Government. *International Journal of Electronic Government Research (IJEGR)*, 14(2), 44-63. doi: 10.4018/ijegr.2018040104

⁴¹ Nurdin, Nurdin, Stockdale, Rosemary, & Scheepers, Helana. (2014a). Coordination and Cooperation in E-Government: An Indonesian Local E-Government Case *The Electronic Journal of Information Systems in developing Countries*, 61(3), 1-21.

⁴²J.M. Morse, *Critical Issue in Qualitative Research Methods*, (London: Sage Publications, 1994)

of a group of people socially and culturally in one site and a lifestyle. Thus the results of the interview were coded in order to build on the themes obtained in interviews and observations. Then these data are interpreted by relating to the theory used in this study.

Findings and Discussion

Multicultural Values Internalized in Learning

The internalization of the values of multicultural education at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Palu City is carried out through intracurricular and extracurricular activities. In the internalization process, based on interviews and observations, it was not only carried out by Arabic language educators, but also carried out by other educators, such as educators in PKN subjects, teachers in Akidah Akhlak subjects and educators in other subjects. The internalized values of multicultural education are character values which are also part of multicultural values, such as being honest, responsible, caring, not discriminating, tolerant and so on. These values are also part of the 16 multicultural values that have been formulated by the Indonesian Islamic Education Educators Association (AGPAII). These values are multicultural values that are relevant to be implemented and instilled in students. Therefore, these values have been listed in textbooks for learning Arabic used by Madrasah Aliyah Negeri in Palu City, including those used by Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Palu City. Based on observations and interviews as well as textbook and syllabus documents and lesson plans for learning Arabic at MAN 1 Palu, the values in question include honesty, discipline, responsibility, care, mutual cooperation, and tolerance.43

In addition to the five values above, of course there are also other multicultural values that are implanted in students which are contained in the core competencies, namely spiritual attitudes and social attitudes such as peace,

 $^{^{\}rm 43}$ Textbook, Syllabus and Lesson Plan for Arabic teaching and learning, and explanations of Arabic teacher in Madrasah Aliyah 1 Kota Palu

polite, responsive, and pro-active which of course can be internalized to students through learning. Indirect teaching in the form of exemplary and habituation from educators. The exemplary provided by educators by exemplifying multiculturalist attitudes will at least be an indirect lesson for their students in their attitudes.

Approaches in Internalizing Multicultural Values

There are several approaches in internalizing the values of multicultural education in learning Arabic at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1, Palu City which are carried out by educators in order to instill values in students so that they have a good and positive attitude. Based on observations and interviews with Arabic language educators at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 in Palu, the approach used in internalizing the values of multicultural education is more likely to use the first and second of the four approaches offered by James A. Banks, namely contributing and additive approaches without changing the existing curriculum. However, in internalizing the values of multicultural education in Arabic learning, it depends more on the role and ability of Arabic educators in terms of insight into the values of multicultural education. Apart from this, teachers or educators must also master basic teaching skills.

The implementation of multicultural education values in a lesson can be done by internalizing multicultural material into the curriculum by integrating it in the actual teaching situation in Arabic subjects. The internalization of multicultural values in learning Arabic at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1, Palu was carried out using three approaches.

a. Semi Contribution Approach

In the context of learning Arabic at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1, Palu, it tends to lead to a contribution approach. However, they do not fully use the contribution approach. Therefore, the author uses the term "semi-contribution" because based on a study of learning documents in the form of textbooks which

are a reference or guide in learning Arabic at Madrsasah Aliyah Negeri, it does not specifically integrate multicultural educational content into the curriculum. But at a glance, there is content of multicultural education values that are included in core competencies such as values about honesty, discipline, responsibility, care, mutual cooperation, cooperation, tolerance, peace, polite, responsive, pro-active, and showing attitude as part of the solution to various problems in interacting effectively with the social and natural environment and in placing oneself as a reflection of the nation in its interactions. These values are also not specifically stated as part of the values of multicultural education. However, by looking at the characteristics of multicultural education and its terminology, it is very clear that these values are part of the values of multicultural education.

The values mentioned above are the values that are included in the core competencies (KI) in each chapter or subject matter in Arabic textbooks for class X to class XII in the 2013 curriculum. core (KI), which is in the Arabic learning curriculum at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Palu, its application in learning tools is also listed in the analysis of graduate competency standards (SKL), content standard analysis (SI), core competency analysis and basic competence (KI). - KD), as well as in the syllabus and in the lesson plan (RPP).

With values like above, of course Arabic educators are required to be able to instill and internalize these values in the learning process, whether it is conveyed directly by linking them with learning material or in the form of attitudes shown by educators in the learning process in their daily lives at school and outside of school.

In addition to the two analyzes above, there is also an analysis of core competencies and basic competencies that have been made by Arabic language educators related to Arabic learning tools at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1, Palu City. In the analysis of core competencies and basic competencies, the competence of spiritual and social attitudes is the main analysis in addition to competency in knowledge and skills. In these four competencies, there are

multicultural values such as appreciating and living up to the teachings of the religion they adhere to, showing honest behavior, discipline, responsibility, care (mutual cooperation, cooperation, tolerance, peace), polite, responsive, and proactive. part of the solution to various problems in interacting effectively with the social and natural environment and placing oneself as a reflection of the nation in the world's interactions.

Thus, the approach used by Arabic language teachers or educators in internalizing the values of multicultural education is a semi-contributory approach by instilling multicultural values in Arabic learning by linking the content of these values with Arabic learning materials. This is based on information from Arabic language educators at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Palu City as follows:

"In learning Arabic, the inculcation of positive values such as honest behavior, responsibility, caring, tolerance, peace, courtesy, responsiveness, and proactiveness which are also part of the social attitudes that students must have is usually done by linking teaching materials. Arabic with these values that are relevant to the teaching material. But at the beginning of learning, the values that are part of the core competencies or social attitudes are also conveyed to students at the beginning of learning and closing activities in the form of reflection and motivation or strengthening to students in which there are values related to multicultural education". 44

Based on the explanation of Arabic language educators above, the approach used by Arabic educators in internalizing the values of multicultural education in Arabic learning is a semi-contribution approach, namely by linking learning materials with positive values and social attitudes which are integrated in The syllabus and lesson plans on core competencies, one of which is to make students have spiritual attitudes and social attitudes by respecting and living the teachings of the religion they adhere to, and showing honest behavior,

⁴⁴Nurjannah, Arabic Teacher in Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Kota Palu, "Interview" 09 December 2019 in teachers' office MAN 2 Kota Palu

discipline, responsibility, care, cooperation, tolerance, peace, courtesy, responsive, and proactive in interacting effectively with the social environment.

b. Semi Additive Approach

The second approach used by Arabic educators at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Palu City is the semi-additive approach. It is said to be semi additive because Banks 'additive approach is not completely applied, there are only a few parts that are considered relevant to Banks' additive approach. As has been explained that this additive approach is the addition of materials, concepts, themes, and perspectives to the curriculum without changing the basic structure of the curriculum. This approach is often complemented by books or modules. In the context of learning Arabic at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Palu City, based on the results of observations and document review, the "semi-additive" approach used is by adding or including spiritual values or attitudes and social attitudes into the syllabus and lesson plans for learning Arabic on basic competencies or core competencies. The syllabus used at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Palu City on core competencies and basic competences includes values that are part of multicultural values. For example, core competency 1 (KI 1) states "appreciating and living up to the teachings of the religion it adheres to". Whereas in core competency 2 (KI 2) more specifically mentions the competence of students who show honest behavior, discipline, responsibility, care, mutual cooperation, cooperation, tolerance, peace), polite, responsive, and proactive as part of the solution on various problems in interacting effectively with the social and natural environment, as well as placing oneself as a reflection of the nation in world relations.

In addition to the syllabus, the learning implementation plan (RPP) includes the four core competencies above. Therefore, by looking at the core competencies that exist in the syllabus and lesson plans in Arabic learning above, it can be seen that there are efforts to instill character values which are

E-ISSN: 2355-7710

P-ISSN: 1411-125X

also part of multicultural values by internalizing them in the Arabic learning

syllabus.

Thus, the second approach used in internalizing the values of

multicultural education in teaching Arabic is a semi-additive approach by

including or including these values in the syllabus and lesson plans for Arabic

language learning.

c. Exemplary Approach

Another approach that is applied in internalizing the values of

multicultural education in learning Arabic at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Palu City

is an exemplary approach in the form of indirect teaching or indirect learning.

Indirect learning or indirect teaching is planting through exemplary,

habituation, and school culture by paying attention to the characteristics of

subjects and the needs and conditions of students.

This approach is the approach taken by Arabic language educators at

Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Palu City (as stated in the analysis of core

competencies and basic competencies (KI-KD) to instill spiritual values or

attitudes (core competency 1) and social attitudes (2) core competence by

providing exemplary and habituation to students. Exemplary referred to in this

context is exemplary shown by educators such as equal treatment, not

discriminating, showing an inclusive attitude, and character attitudes or other

characters that can be used as role model by students.

Based on existing data, it shows that the approaches used in internalizing the

values of multicultural education in learning Arabic are the semi-contributed

approach, the semi-additive approach, and the indirect teaching or direct

learning approach.

Discussion

Jurnal Hunafa: Studia Islamika

Based on the data findings in the field in the learning process of Arabic in the classroom carried out by Arabic educators at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1, Palu City, it shows that the approach used in internalizing multicultural values in learning Arabic is a semi-contributed approach, a semi-additive approach, and the exemplary approach or indirect teaching. These three approaches are implemented in learning Arabic.

In implementing these three approaches, of course, very much depends on the ability and role of the Arabic teacher or educator on the insight into multiculturalism. Apart from that, the most important thing in this case is the Arabic educators' mastery of basic teaching skills, such as opening and closing learning skills, strengthening skills, managing classes, and so on. With mastery of these teaching skills will make it easier for educators to internalize multicultural values in the learning process.

An illustration of the three approaches implemented at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 can be seen in the following table:

Approaches in Multicultural Education Implementatio

	Perspective of Internalized	Methods or Ways of
Internalizing	Multicultural Education	Internalizing
Multicultural	Values	Multicultural
Education Values		Education Values
Semi Contribution	Honesty, discipline, responsibility, care, mutual cooperation, cooperation, tolerance, peace, polite, responsive, pro-active, which is reflected in social and	KI, and KD, and linking these values with the

	spiritual attitudes	
0 1 1 1111	1	. 11:
Semi Additive	The core competencies and	
	basic competencies in the	
	syllabus and lesson plans	Education Values in the
	include the values that are	Syllabus and RPP
	expected by students to show	
	honest behavior, discipline,	
	responsibility, care for mutual	
	cooperation, cooperation,	
	tolerance, peace, polite,	
	responsive, and proactive as	
	part of the solution on various	
	problems in interacting	
	effectively with the social and	
	natural environment.	
Exemplary	Providing exemplary (in the	Shows multiculturalist
	form of indirect teaching) to	
	participants by treating them	
	fairly without discriminating	
	against cultural backgrounds,	
	origins and levels of	
	intelligence in both	
	1	learning
	extracurricular activities.	
	Value Perspective: equality,	
	democracy, honesty, fairness,	
	and discipline.	

Basically, the three approaches implemented by Arabic language educators at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Palu City to internalize the values of multicultural education in learning Arabic are to help students in developing the ability to recognize, accept, and appreciate the cultural diversity that exists around it, not discriminatory, not full of prejudice, always promote a tolerant and open attitude and always have good prejudice or husnuzhzhan.

Conclusion

Multicultural values internalized in learning Arabic at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri 1 Palu are values that have been included in the Arabic language learning

curriculum and are contained in the syllabus and lesson plans which are officially used in the three madrasas. These values are honesty, discipline, courtesy, care for others, cooperation, tolerance, peace, responsibility, responsiveness, proactive, husnuzhan (prejudice), openness, respect for others, confidence, and trust. There are three approaches used by Arabic language educators in internalizing multicultural values in Arabic language learning, namely the semi-contribution approach, the semi-adaptive approach, and the exemplary approach through indirect teaching or indirect learning.

References

- Alhakim, Suparlan dan Sri Untari. Pendidikan Multikultural, Strategi Inovatif Pembelajaran dalam Pluralitas Masyarakat Indonesia. Malang: Madani Media, 2018.
- Amirin, Tatang M. "Pendekatan dan langkah Pendidikan Multikultural", dalam https://tatangmanguni.wordpres.com/2009/6/11/pendekatan pendekatan -dan -langkah-langkah-pendidikan-multikultural/ diunduh pada tanggal 24 Maret 2019
- Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa, Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia Edisi Kelima, (Digital Version) KBBI V. 0.2.0 Beta (20)
- Banks, James A. An Introduction to Multicultural Education. New York: Pearson,
- Banks, James A. Race, Culture, and Education: The Selected Works of James A. Banks. London: Routledge, 2006.
- Banks, James A. and Cherry A. McGee Banks, *Multicultural Education: Issues and Perspectives*. United States: Wiley & Sons Inc. 2010.
- Buku Paket, Silabus dan RPP Mata Pelajaran Bahasa Arab, dan penjelasan para guru Bahasa Arab di Madrasah Aliyah 1 Kota Palu
- Creswell, John W. Resesarch Design; Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitatif, dan Mixed. Terj. Ahmad Fawaid. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2010.
- Evita, Evita, Syahid, Ahmad, & Nurdin, Nurdin. (2019). Understanding Students' Learning Outcomes Differences Through the Application of the Market Place Activity Type of Cooperative Learning Model and the Application of Conventional Learning Models International Journal of Contemporary Islamic Education, 1(1), 67-85.
- Gay, Geneva. Bridging Multicultural Theory and Praktis, tp, 1999.
- Harto, Kasinyo. Pengembangan Pendidikan Agama Islam Berbasis Multikutural, Jurnal At-Tahrir Volume 14 No. 2 Mei 2014.
- Hernandez, Hilda. *Multicultural Education: A Teacher's Guide to Linking Context, Process, and Content.* New Jersey & Ohio: Pentice Hall 2000.

- Kendall, Frances. *Diversity in The Classroom, a Multicultural Approach to Education of Young Children*. New York: Teacher College Press, 1990.
- Kurniati, Kurniati, Nurdin, Nurdin, & Nurasmawati, Nurasmawati. (2020). Improving Students' Cognitive and Affective Domains Students through Fostering Teacher Development *International Journal of Contemporary Islamic Education*, 2(2), 56-70.
- Lickona, Thomas W. Educating for Chracter: How Our School Can Teach Respect and Responsibility. New York: Bantam Books 2000.
- Madjid, Nurkhalis. *Pluralitas Agama, Kerukunan dalam Keragaman.* Jakarta: Kompas Media Nusantara, 2001.
- Mahfud, Choirul. Pendidikan Multikultural, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2016.
- Morse, J.M. Critical Issue in Qualitative Research Methods. London: Sage Publications, 1994.
- Mughni, Syafiq A. Pendidikan Berbasis Multikulturalisme, Kata Pengantar dalam buku *Pendidikan Multikultural*, oleh Choirul Mahfud, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2016.
- Naim, Ngainum dan Ahmad Sauqi, *Pendidikan Multikultural.* Yogyakarta: Arruzz Media, 2017
- Nurcahyono, Hadi. *Pendidikan Multikultural di Indonesia: Analisis Sinkronis dan Duakronis.* Jurnal Habitus: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosiologi, dan Antropologi, Volume 2 No. 1 Maret 2018
- Nurdin, Nurdin. (2018). Institutional Arrangements in E-Government Implementation and Use: A Case Study From Indonesian Local Government. International Journal of Electronic Government Research (IJEGR), 14(2), 44-63. doi: 10.4018/ijegr.2018040104
- Nurdin, Nurdin, Stockdale, Rosemary, & Scheepers, Helana. (2014a). Coordination and Cooperation in E-Government: An Indonesian Local E-Government Case The Electronic Journal of Information Systems in developing Countries, 61(3), 1-21.
- Race, Richard. Multiculturalism and Education. London: Continuum International Publishing, 2011.
- Raihani, *Pendidikan Islam dalam Masyarakat Multikultural.* Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2016.
- Republik Indonesia, Undang-undang Republik Indonesia No 20 Tahun 2003 Tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional, Jakarta: Depdiknas RI, 2010.
- Rosyada, Dede. Pendidikan Multikultural di Indonesia, Sebuah Pandangan Konseptual, Jurnal Sosio Didaktika, Volume 1 No. 1 Mei 2014.
- Rosyadi, Khoiran. Pendidikan Profetik. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2004.
- Salmiwati, Urgensi Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam Pengembangan Nilai-nilai Multikutural. Jurnal At-Ta'lim, Jilid 1 Namor 4 Februari 2013.
- Sinagatullin, Ilghiz M. Constructing Multicultural Eduction in a Diverse Society, Maryland: Scarecrow Press.Inc, 2003.
- Sulalah. Pendidikan Multikultural, Didaktika Niali-nilai Universalitas Kebangsaan, Malang: UIN Maliki Press, 2011.
- Suryana, Yaya dan H.A. Rusdiana, *Pendidikan Multikultural, Suatu Upaya Penguatan Jati Diri Bangsa.* Bandung: Pustaka Setia, 2015.

- Sutiyono, Values of Multiculturalism in The Process of Teaching and Learning the Dance Arts, Journal of Studies in Social Sciences, ISSN 2201-4624, Volume 11 Number 1, 2015.
- Tahir, Masnun. Menjadi Muslim di Negara Multikultural: Dinamika, Tantangan, dan Strategi dalam Persfektif Fikih Multikultural. Jurnal Al-'Adalah Universitas Raden Intan Lampung, Volume 14 Nomor 2 Tahun 2017
- Tilaar, H.A.R. *Multikulturalisme, Tantangan Global Masa Depan.* Jakarta: Grasindo, 2011.
- Tolkhah, Imam dkk, Panduan Integrasi Nilai Multikultural dalam Pendidikan Agama Islam pada SMA dan SMK, Jakarta: AGPAII, 2011.
- Ubadah, Metode Pembelajaran Bahasa Arab yang Efektif untuk Meningkatkan Kemampuan Bercakap Bahasa Arab, Jurnal Istiqra' (Jurnal Penelitian Ilmiah LP2M IAIN Palu) Volume 4 No. 1 Juni 2016
- Yaqin, M. Ainul. Pendidikan Multikultural Cross-Cultural Understanding untuk Demokrasi dan keadilan. Yogyakarta: Pilar Media, 2005.
- Zakiyah, Qiqi Yuliati dan H.A. Rusdiana, *Pendidikan Nilai, Kajian Teori dan Praktek di Sekolah.* Bandung: Pustaka Setia, 2014.